



City of Greenville
Design Review Board – Urban Design Panel
Minutes of the **February 6th** Regular Meeting
10th Floor – Council Chambers 4:00PM
Meeting Notice Posted on Wednesday, January 22nd, 2020
Minutes prepared by Matt Lonnerstater

Members Present: Carmella Cioffi, John Edwards, Danielle Fontaine, Mitch Lehde

Members Absent: William Crawford

Staff Present: Jay Graham, Planning and Development Manager, Logan Wells, Assistant City Attorney; Courtney Powell, Senior Development Planner; Matt Lonnerstater, Development Planner; Brennan Williams, Development Planner; Benjamin Abdo, Development Planner; Kris Kurjiaka, Development Planner; Christa Jordan, Landscape Architect

Call to Order:

Chairwoman Carmella Cioffi called the meeting to order at 4:00 PM. She welcomed those in attendance and explained the procedures for the meeting. The minutes of the January 2, 2020 meeting were approved unanimously. The agenda for the February 6, 2020 meeting was accepted unanimously. All affidavits were received. Mitch Lehde expressed a conflict of interest for CA 17-1026/CA 20-23 and RHP 17-1027.

Old Business (public hearing):

- A. CA 19-171** Application by Woodfield Investments (Brian Schick) for a REVISED CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS for modifications to the previously-approved CA on property located at 356 Field St. (TM# 008700-01-00100).

Lonnerstater presented the proposed modifications to the previously-approved Certificate of Appropriateness for a mixed-use development at 356 Field St. As part of this development, the Board previously-approved the relocation of the Shoeless Joe Jackson Museum and site approval for a new museum annex. Architectural elevations were not provided as part of the previous approval; annex elevations and renderings are now proposed. Lonnerstater explained the annex connection to the existing museum and overviewed building materials, including a brick veneer, fiber cement panels, and sloped shed-style roof.

Lonnerstater outlined staff's concerns regarding the design, as formally submitted: 1) The sloped shed roof is not appropriate for the retail area; 2) a gabled roof form should be considered for the annex retail area to respect the gabled roof form of the existing house; and 3) additional transparency should be provided along the west and south elevations. Lonnerstater stated staff's recommendation of denial of the plans as formally submitted. Prior to the DRB meeting, staff met with the applicant and explained staff concerns.

Lonnerstater explained that the applicants had provided a modified design to staff, of which staff is supportive. While staff recommends denial of the formally-submitted plans, staff recommends approval of the updated elevations with modifications as follows: 1) Replacement of the roof element with a flat roof; 2) additional transparency on the walls adjacent to the circulation element; and 3) incorporation of a living wall element. The recommendation of approval comes with stipulation that the building permit will not be issued until plans reflecting such modifications are submitted to and verified by the administrator. Further stipulation is that depicted signage is illustrative in nature; a separate sign package will need to be submitted prior to permitting.

Brian Schick, applicant, presented the revised annex building designs and elevations. Joe Bryant, Engineer, explained the plaza and stair design. Alberto Villa Cevallos, architect, outlined the building hyphen element/connection to the existing museum, the proposed living wall, building materials, and courtyard areas.

FINAL

Danielle Fontaine applauded the new design but expressed concern over living wall element and proposed an alternative mural on the façade. John Edwards and Carmella Cioffi commended new design. Mitch Lehde commended mass and scale of modified design.

Brian Schick deferred to the Board for comment on whether living wall or mural would be more appropriate, but expressed desire to have the option to choose.

Board deliberated on process for giving the applicant a choice between mural and living wall. Jay Graham commented that murals would be subject to the Art in Public Places Commission.

Attorney Logan Wells clarified that Board could act on modified application, but motion would need to articulate the items to be modified and stipulate that the administrator would need to verify the plans.

Mike Wallach, Managing Director of the Board of Directors for the Shoeless Joe Jackson Museum, spoke in favor of the modified design. No one from the public spoke against the application.

Mitch Lehde moved to approve the newly-presented plan which depicts the following modifications: 1) incorporation of flat roof; 2) addition of building transparency; and 3) addition of living green wall. Approval comes with stipulation that the modified plan be formally submitted to the administrator for verification. Motion seconded by John Edwards and approved 4-0.

B. CA 17-1026/CA 20-23 Application by Stuart R. Stenger for a REVISED CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS for modifications to the previously-approved CA on property located at 10 Toy St. (TM #004500-01-00700).

Mitch Lehde recused himself.

Lonnerstater presented the proposed modifications to the previously-approved Certificate of Appropriateness, and explained that the application is related to RHP 17-1027 listed on the agenda under "Other Business". Subject property is located within Pettigru Street Preservation Overlay District and is improved with the Hayne School, constructed in 1919. DRB has approved several previous applications related to the rehabilitation of the historic building. Lonnerstater presented the proposed modifications, including: an exterior, two-story steel-framed terrace at rear of building; a three-story brick feature wall at rear of building; an indoor/outdoor kitchen addition; sunshade and trellis features; and a stained wood screen wall around the staircase on lower level.

Lonnerstater explained staff's recommendation of approval, with conditions: 1) Revise color of stained screen wall to be more in-line with the darker tone of the terrace additions/brick feature wall; 2) Remove EIFS on kitchen and replace with an alternate material; 3) Provide an existing conditions/demolition plan denoting existing architectural features to be removed/modified; and 4) Clarify how the main-level sunshade feature is to be structurally-supported; Modified plans should be reviewed and accepted by Staff and two members of the Design Review Board.

Powell presented the revised Final Special Tax Assessment request, which is on the agenda under "Other Business." Powell outlined the rehabilitation standards contained in the Land Management Ordinance, and explained that the applicant has the option to revise the application if the Board feels that revisions do not meet the rehabilitation standards,

Stuart Stenger, applicant, presented updated renderings based on staff's comments, and emphasized its minimalistic design. Stenger clarified that existing canopies and windows on the 1980s rear addition are to be revised. The wood panel wall on the ground-level provides security for upper-stories. Kitchen material has been modified from EIFS to a cementitious material.

Cioffi asked for clarification on the wood fence around staircase. Stenger explained that fence has egress bar on the inside but no hardware on outside. Stenger explained that only the shade-sails would be connected to the brick and mortar; hardware will go through the brick but will not be structurally-supported by brick. Additionally, the outdoor exhaust pipe on kitchen will be concealed by the parapet.

FINAL

No one from the public spoke in favor or against the application.

Cioffi summarized the previously-stated staff conditions.

Fontaine made a motion to approve CA 20-23/CA17-1026 with the following conditions: 1) Revise color of stained screen wall to be more in-line with the darker tone of the terrace additions/brick feature wall; 2) Remove EIFS on kitchen and replace with an alternate material; 3) Provide an existing conditions/demolition plan denoting existing architectural features to be removed/modified; and 4) Clarify how the main-level sunshade feature is to be structurally-supported. Modified plans shall be reviewed and accepted by Staff and two members of the Design Review Board. The motion was seconded by Edwards, approved 3-0.

Mitch Lehde re-joined the meeting.

New Business (public hearing):

- A. CA 20-08** Application by William Letourneau for a CERTIFICATE OF APPROPRIATENESS for an exception to sign standards on property located at 175 Patewood Dr. (TM #054302-01-01101).

Lonnerstater presented the application for exceptions to sign standards to install one (1) freestanding monument sign on a precast concrete base at the Prisma Health office and Patewood Hospital location at 175 Patewood Drive. Lonnerstater explained that the proposed sign exceeds maximum sign face area and sign height permitted by the Land Management Ordinance. The proposed sign features a face area of approx. 57 sq. ft. and height of 12 ft. 2 in., while the sign ordinance only permits staff to approve signs up to 36 sq. ft. in area and 10 ft. tall. Applicant also requests an exception to the sign standard which only allows for logos and lettering to be illuminated. Lonnerstater presented sign renderings, which feature an illuminated fin and an internally-illuminated cabinet.

Lonnerstater outlined staff's recommendation of approval for exceptions to sign standards with the condition that the pre-cast concrete base of the sign be modified to feature alternative natural materials or that landscaping be planted around the base of the sign.

Rick Spitz, Director of Architecture for Prisma Health, explained that the concrete base would be painted to match other previously-approved signs. Spitz explained that sprinkler/irrigation would not be provided if landscaping were to be required. Sign base is 1 ft. - 4 in. tall.

William Letourneau, applicant, explained that approx. 200-300 signs around the upstate feature a similar sign base.

No one from the public spoke in favor or against the application.

Cioffi and Edwards mentioned that they had no major issues with design of the sign base without landscaping.

Edwards made a motion to approve application CA 20-08 as submitted. Motion seconded by Fontaine, approved 4-0.

Other Business (Not a Public Hearing)

- A. RHP 17-1027** Application by Stuart R. Stenger for a REVISED FINAL HISTORIC PROPERTIES TAX ASSESSMENT on property located at 10 Toy St. (TM # 004500-01-00700).

Mitch Lehde recused himself.

Powell summarized staff's recommendation of approval for modifications to the final historic properties tax assessment, as presented previously under agenda item CA 17-1026/CA 20-23 and in staff report.

Edwards made a motion to approve revised RHP 17-1027, as submitted. Motion seconded by Fontaine, approved 3-0.

Mitch Lehde re-joined the meeting.

FINAL

Advice and Comment (Not a Public Hearing)

- A. MD 20-001** Application by Graycliff Capital Development LLC for a MULTI-FAMILY DEVELOPMENT of 268 units on 22.44 acres located at Woodruff Rd. and Salters Rd. (TMs #026100-01-00600 and 026100-01-00900).

Seth Peterson, Director of Development for Graycliff Capital, explained the project as a market-rate community with 20% of units designated as affordable (80% of AMI).

Mike Osmond, architect, overviewed the various proposed building types: three and four-story split buildings and carriage-house buildings. The buildings are designed as garden-style walkup with breezeways with gable and hip roofs. Color palette is a light off-white with blue accents.

Fontaine stated that the breezeway entrance elements appear more successful on the four-story buildings than on the three -story buildings. Fontaine recommended that the brick element go up to two-stories on both the three and four-story buildings. The entrance areas on the three-story building are not super “friendly.” Fontaine commended the site plan and open space areas.

Cioffi stated that the color scheme feels slightly monochromatic. Cioffi recommended greater variation in color between the brick and lap siding.

Informal Review (Not a Public Hearing):

- A.** Informal review of preliminary design of a new building for First Presbyterian Church located at the intersection of W. Washington St. and N. Academy St.

David Dixon, architect, spoke on behalf of the project and provided an update on the project design. Project consists of demolition of one building and construction of a new building and plaza area.

The Board commended the building design and its relationship to the historic building. Edwards recommended that, upon formal submittal, clarification be provided on how Academy St. façade interacts with streetscape. Edwards commented that pedestrian/street-oriented landscaping will be important. Lower-level windows should extend down to floor-plane. Lehde commented that building lighting can be used to activate Academy St. façade. Fontaine commented that a sculpture would be beneficial to plaza area.

- B.** Informal review of preliminary design of entrance and patio canopy addition for Tupelo Honey located at 1 N. Main St., Suite T.

Alex Crawford, architect, spoke on behalf of the project and presented renderings for a new vestibule and canopy over the outdoor patio.

Board discussed the material and color of proposed vestibule. Board recommended that the vestibule’s fenestration and windows be aligned with the building.

Election of Chair and Vice-Chair

- A.** Chair

Danielle Fontaine nominated Carmella Cioffi as CHAIR, who accepted. The Panel approved Carmella Cioffi as CHAIR.

- B.** Vice-Chair

John Edwards nominated Mitch Lehde as VICE-CHAIR, who accepted. The Panel approved Mitch Lehde as VICE-CHAIR.

Adjourn:

Having no other business, the meeting adjourned at 6:04 p.m.